



**SANTA CRUZ METROPOLITAN TRANSIT DISTRICT (METRO)  
PERSONNEL/HUMAN RESOURCES STANDING COMMITTEE  
**REVISED** MEETING MINUTES  
SEPTEMBER 21, 2016 – 11:00 AM  
METRO ADMIN OFFICES  
110 VERNON STREET, SANTA CRUZ, CA 95060**

The Personnel/Human Resources Standing Committee convened a meeting as referenced above. The Meeting Agenda Packet can be found online at [www.SCMTD.com](http://www.SCMTD.com) and is available for inspection at Santa Cruz Metro's Administrative offices at 110 Vernon Street, Santa Cruz, California.

This document has been created with accessibility in mind. With the exception of certain 3rd party and other attachments, it passes the Adobe Acrobat XI Accessibility Full Check. If you have any questions about the accessibility of this document, please email your inquiry to [accessibility@scmtd.com](mailto:accessibility@scmtd.com)

**COMMITTEE ROSTER**

Director Dene Bustichi	City of Scotts Valley
Director Jimmy Dutra, Vice Chair	City of Watsonville
Director Donald Norm Hagen	County of Santa Cruz
Director John Leopold	County of Santa Cruz
Director Mike Rotkin, Chair	County of Santa Cruz
Alex Clifford	METRO CEO/General Manager
Leslyn K. Syren	METRO District Counsel

**MEETING TIME: 11:00AM**

NOTE: THE COMMITTEE CHAIR MAY TAKE ITEMS OUT OF ORDER

- 1 CALL TO ORDER**  
Meeting was called to order at 11:10AM by Chair Rotkin.
- 2 ROLL CALL:** The following Directors were **present**, representing quorum:

<b>Director Dene Bustichi</b>	<b>City of Scotts Valley</b>
<b>Director Jimmy Dutra, Vice Chair</b>	<b>City of Watsonville</b>
<b>Director Donald Norm Hagen</b>	<b>County of Santa Cruz</b>
<b>Director Mike Rotkin, Chair</b>	<b>County of Santa Cruz</b>

Director John Leopold was absent.

METRO EMPLOYEES AND MEMBERS OF THE PUBLIC WHO VOLUNTARILY INDICATED THEY WERE PRESENT (IN ALPHABETICAL ORDER) WERE:

Lorraine Bayer, SEIU	Holly Riley, Undeclared
Patti Davidoski, SEIU	Robyn Slater, METRO
Joan Jeffries, SEIU	

**3 SELECT COMMITTEE CHAIR AND VICE CHAIR**

Board Chair Rotkin asked for volunteers to serve as Committee Chair and Committee Vice Chair. Hearing none, Director Bustichi nominated Director Dutra as Committee Chair and Director Hagen as Committee Vice Chair. Carried unanimously by all members present.

**4 ADDITIONS OR DELETIONS FROM AGENDA / ADDITIONAL DOCUMENTATION TO SUPPORT EXISTING AGENDA ITEMS**

None.

**5 COMMUNICATIONS TO THE PERSONNEL/HUMAN RESOURCES STANDING COMMITTEE**

Eduardo Montesino, representing bus operators and paratransit personnel, asked if the Committee would be conducting interviews before going to the Board as time is critical with both the General Counsel and Human Resources Manager position.

Board Chair Rotkin responded that Standing Committees were discussed at last year's Board offsite and it seemed important to have a structure and process in place for management reviews, etc. This Committee is being established for the long haul. They will not be stepping into items which are "already in the works" unless requested by METRO staff. This Committee cannot make final decisions, only recommendations to the METRO Board.

**6 DEVELOPMENT OF BYLAWS FOR PERSONNEL/HUMAN RESOURCES COMMITTEE**

District Counsel Syren referred to the Capital Project Standing Committee meeting held on September 20<sup>th</sup>, 2016 where the development of Bylaws was discussed and it was determined that the Standing Committees would abide by the existing METRO Board Bylaws. The Standing Committees will be subject to the Brown Act; i.e., notices, minutes taken and updates provided to the regular METRO Board meetings. It is her recommendation that this Committee do the same.

Board Chair Rotkin said he's thought of other responsibilities the Committee may undertake/include such as compensation studies, processes, etc. He would like to see a 'charge' developed for the Committee that would include items the Committee would like to see staff bring forward.

CEO Clifford said he would email the original Board report dated 8/26/16 to the Committee members which included a list of Committee responsibilities to refresh everyone's memory of the Committee's 'charge'. He since has been reminded that the Committee can also address items as requested by the Board.

District Counsel Syren provided the Committee members with a explanation of the differences between Ad Hoc and Standing committees. Board Chair Rotkin requested that this Committee send a recommendation to the Board in October in the form of a more detailed staff report regarding the creation of committees which would include the addition/modification CEO Clifford mentioned above.

CEO Clifford added that, as METRO moves forward with Standing Committees, a subject matter may arise that you determine is best always addressed in Committee prior to going to the full Board. This is helpful to METRO staff to keep on track and as a time saving mechanism.

## 7 REVIEW OF CLASS & COMPENSATION STUDY SCOPE OF WORK

Robyn Slater, Human Resources Manager, provided commentary to the materials provided in the agenda packet.

Board Chair Rotkin asked Ms. Slater for an explanation of the step structure.

Ms. Slater recommended METRO move away from the step structure to the industry standards, a “pay for performance” standard/process. Within certain parameters, an increase would come under the purview of the CEO/General Manager.

CEO Clifford noted this demonstrates the need to bring this to the Personnel/Human Resources Standing Committee; we need to determine METRO's philosophy to guide us through the process which affects an employee's pay.

Committee Chair Dutra asked if there are any positions which we are not filling, which are being held back.

Ms. Slater answered yes; we are making adjustments on an emergency basis. This will be a long process; she estimates six months to one year after the individual is hired.

Board Chair Rotkin asked if the SEIU agreements contain the opportunity for comparable studies.

Ms. Slater responded that all of the Union contracts contain an opportunity for an individual to request a reclass.

CEO Clifford reminded the assembly that today's objective is to agree on a Scope of Work for the consultant search.

Public comment:

Joan Jeffries, SEIU member, said the second sentence under Project Objective of the Management Classification and Compensation Study document was misleading. It reads, “Classification and wage surveys have been conducted as required by contractual language for unionized positions.” SEIU members are concerned that the study will be conducted for management before union members. In the MOUs union members are allowed to request one group reclass per year. There are 18+ distinct groups/career ladders. Each year, we rotate among the different unions. All of this is to say, because nothing has been done in a comprehensive way, it's a time consuming process whenever HR receives a request. If METRO would consider completing both studies at the same time, it would boost the morale of all METRO employees.

Director Bustichi asked Ms. Jeffries if they would be willing to do a study for an entire group every “X” number of years rather than one per year; to replace the current bargaining agreement which allows one wage compensation study per year.

Ms. Jeffries responded that if a comprehensive study is done, there wouldn't be the need for language to allow for the one-offs. There are individual positions which don't fall within a group and can be requested as an individual reclass. Can we bring these outliers into a group for some sort of promotion?

Mr. Montesino, said Fixed Route does not have this latitude; this is only allowed when we negotiate. During negotiations, we reclassify every three years; but, no compensation study was done. As a small agency, everyone does multiple jobs; we are a driver/customer service agent. The SEIU positions are outdated. There is a need; but it's an agency-wide need.

CEO Clifford noted that the Board approved this to proceed in late 2014. The current contract has two sections: 1) Wage studies which can conduct three or they can chose a

group annually in December; and, 2) A section which deals with reclassifications in which they can choose three and one of the groups. These options are exercised on a regular basis and this results occasionally in a reclass and/or wage change in addition to the wage change on an annual basis. Numerous positions over the last 10 years have been reviewed; many with recommendations for pay increases. We are in the final stages of re-classing a group within the Finance Department; this will include wage and reclass recommendations which will be brought to the Board in October.

CEO Clifford distributed a document entitled, Classification Study, Reclassification of Comp Study (Salary Survey) June 2011 – December 2015, which outlines 10 years of reclass history. This has never been done for management. As annual wage and reclass adjustments are made, it creates compression and the delta that should occur between positions is eroded. CEO Clifford understands SEIU's concerns; their negotiations will come up soon.

Director Bustichi asked if it would be easier or harder if all bargaining units were to agree that everything be stricken and a compensation study completed every four years or so for every METRO employee.

CEO Clifford responded that it is a complex situation. The MOU language affects an annual individual approach.

District Counsel Syren added in most agencies, once a comprehensive class and comp study is completed; a moratorium is put upon the employees to be able to use what is in the contract for a set period of time. So there is some flexibility between maintaining what is in the contract and what Director Bustichi is suggesting.

Board Chair Rotkin wants to make it clear that it is their intention to identify their commitment to METRO and its employees: conduct the management study; to be followed immediately by a complete compensation study for the remainder of the employees as necessary. He has a sense that UTU is relatively well paid while SEIU is behind the market.

Committee Chair Dutra asked if SEIU is underpaid; has reclass kept salaries to standards and updating job descriptions? Is there something on the horizon we can do with SEIU? And, why do we continually update the job classifications?

CEO Clifford responded that these are the type of discussions we will have throughout the agency. A policy needs to be determined in both management and SEIU categories. Yes, as the union exercises the two MOU clauses, reclass has kept salaries to standards. We may begin the SEIU study before management is complete due to the timing of the expiration of their contract. CEO Clifford will advocate for a total compensation approach which SEIU has not allowed to date. This restricts us to past practice. When reclasses are conducted, which results in a new job description, we try to capture the correct job duties.

District Counsel Syren suggested that an option be added to the RFP the ability to study the SEIU positions. We would not have to utilize this option, but it may help in the procurement process. If a company is located which is a good fit, you would be able to transition into the second study.

**MOTION: APPROVE THE CLASS & COMPENSATION STUDY SCOPE OF WORK AND PROVIDE A RECOMMENDATION TO THE METRO BOARD WITH 2 CAVEATS: THE PACKAGE IS TOTAL COMPENSATION AND SEIU AGREES THAT THE STUDY WILL BE USED AS A BASIS FOR FUTURE NEGOTIATIONS.**

**MOTION: DIRECTOR BUSTICHI SECOND: COMMITTEE VICE CHAIR HAGEN  
MOTION CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY WITH DIRECTOR LEOPOLD ABSENT.**

Board Chair Rotkin cautioned the Committee cannot impose this upon the SEIU without consulting them. Director Bustichi clarified this is simply a recommendation to the Board to allow staff to move forward with the process in obtaining costs, timeframes, etc. and allow time for staff to discuss this with SEIU such that when and if the Board approves, we can move forward.

CEO Clifford clarified that the SEIU option would not be exercised until a later date and until the Board makes the decision to do so.

Ms. Jeffries said the MOU contains individual reclass options but is limited to those positions which do not fall within an existing ladder. The option for a wage study is near impossible if you have not had a recent reclass; it requires a recent job description. Reclass is the goal.

Board Chair Rotkin said the Board recognizes that positions need to be updated. Management has had no chance for reclass or rewriting of job descriptions. Moving ahead with a management compensation study does not mean they do not support the SEIU. He recognizes that our bus drivers/employees do a very different job than elsewhere. SEIU is behind the market.

Mr. Montesino noted there is no mention of budget or cost for the study.

Board Chair Rotkin said costs will be received with the RFP responses.

Committee Chair Dutra asked how many bids were anticipated.

CEO Clifford said we anticipate at least two; probably more.

Director Bustichi suggested the RFP be in a format that would have two prices to trigger the next phase; this permits the ability to stop the process if it's not working out.

***Committee Vice Chair Hagen departed at 12:05PM.***

**8 ANNOUNCEMENT OF NEXT MEETING:**

Committee Chair Dutra announced the next meeting date will be determined.

**9 ADJOURNMENT**

Committee Chair Dutra adjourned the meeting at 12:11PM.

Pursuant to Section 54954.2(a)(1) of the Government Code of the State of California, this agenda was posted at least 72 hours in advance of the scheduled meeting at a public place freely accessible to the public 24 hours a day. The agenda packet and materials related to an item on this Agenda submitted after distribution of the agenda packet are available for public inspection in the Santa Cruz METRO Administrative Office (110 Vernon Street, Santa Cruz) during normal business hours. Such documents are also available on the Santa Cruz METRO website at [www.scmtd.com](http://www.scmtd.com) subject to staff's ability to post the document before the meeting.

CORRECTED Attachment

Classification Study, Reclassification, or Comp Study (Salary Survey)						
June 2011 - December 2015						
Type of Request	Original Position Title	New Position Title	Old pay	Recommended Pay	Step 6 % Change	Remarks
<b>June 2015 (BOD - 06/24/16)</b>						
Classification and Comp Study	Reservationist	Customer Service Representative (CSR)	\$13.58 - \$20.07	\$18.38 - \$23.38	14.16%	Reservationist moved from UTU to SEIU and converted to CSR
Classification and Comp Study	Customer Service Representative (CSR)	Customer Service Representative (CSR)	\$18.18 - \$23.18	\$18.38 - \$23.38	0.86%	CSR position description and pay change
Classification and Comp Study	Customer Service Coordinator (CSC)	Customer Service Coordinator (CSC)	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
<b>December 2014 (BOD 11/13/15)</b>						
Comp Study	Accountant I	N/A	\$26.91 - \$34.40	\$29.05 - \$37.08	7.23%	Pay change only
Comp Study	Accountant II	N/A	\$28.23 - \$36.08	\$30.50 - \$38.91	7.27%	Pay change only
Comp Study	Supervising Accountant	N/A	\$33.37 - \$42.56	\$35.08 - \$44.76	5.14%	Pay change only
<b>December 2014 (BOD - 08/14/15)</b>						
Classification Study	Schedule Analyst	Schedule Analyst	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Union and METRO agreed a wage survey was unnecessary
<b>May 2014 (BOD 02/13/15)</b>						
Classification and Comp Study	None	Safety Specialist	N/A	\$32.53 - \$41.49	0.00%	Position description and pay created
Classification and Comp Study	None	Senior Safety Specialist	N/A	\$37.64 - \$48.06	0.00%	Position description and pay created
Classification and Comp Study	None	Assistant Safety and Training Coordinator	N/A	\$29.17 - \$37.88	0.00%	Position description and pay created
Classification and Comp Study	None	Electronic Technician	N/A	\$26.05 - \$33.25	0.00%	Position description created and use of FM Mechanic III pay scale
<b>October 2014 (BOD - 11/14/14)</b>						
Classification and Comp Study	None	Human Resources Generalist	N/A	\$27.25 - \$34.80	0.00%	Position description and pay created
<b>August 2014 (BOD 08/22/14)</b>						
Classification Study	Administrative Coordinator	None	\$30.17 - \$38.52	N/A	0%	Position moved to Management Comp Plan
<b>December 2011 (BOD 06/24/11)</b>						
Classification and Comp Study	Senior Accounting Technician	Payroll Accounting Support Specialist	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only

CORRECTED Attachment

Classification Study, Reclassification, or Comp Study (Salary Survey)						
June 2011 - December 2015						
Type of Request	Original Position Title	New Position Title	Old pay	Recommended Pay	Step 6 % Change	Remarks
<u>June 2012 (BOD - 11/09/12)</u>						
Classification and Comp Study	none	Sr. Financial Analyst	N/A	\$31.07 - \$39.66	0.00%	Position description and pay created
Classification and Comp Study	Financial Analyst	Financial Analyst	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
<u>December 2010 (BOD - 09/09/11)</u>						
Classification and Comp Study	Benefits Coordinator	Benefits Administrator	\$21.56 - \$27.53	\$22.60 - \$28.86	4.61%	Position description and pay change
<u>April 2009 (BOD - 02/26/10)</u>						
Classification and Comp Study	Transportation Planning Supervisor	Transportation Planning Supervisor	\$29.17 - \$37.23	\$30.05 - \$38.35	2.92%	Position description and pay change
Classification and Comp Study	Sr. Transportation Planner	Sr. Transportation Planner	\$27.78 - \$35.46	\$28.61 - \$36.52	2.90%	Position description and pay change
Classification and Comp Study	Transportation Planner	Transportation Planner	\$26.46 - \$33.77	\$27.25 - \$34.78	2.90%	Position description and pay change
Classification and Comp Study	Jr. Transportation Planner	Jr. Transportation Planner	\$20.79 - \$26.53	\$21.41 - \$27.33	2.93%	Position description and pay change
Classification and Comp Study	Transportation Planning Aide	Transportation Planning Aide	\$ 19.80 - \$25.27	\$20.39 - \$26.03	2.92%	Position description and pay change
<u>December 2009 (BOD - 08/13/10)</u>						
Classification and Comp Study	Mechanic I	Mechanic I	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
Classification and Comp Study	Mechanic II	Mechanic II	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
Classification and Comp Study	Mechanic III	Mechanic III	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
Classification and Comp Study	Lead Mechanic	Lead Mechanic	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
Classification and Comp Study	Fleet Maintenance Supervisor	Fleet Maintenance Supervisor	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
<u>June 2008 (BOD - 02/27/09)</u>						
Classification and Comp Study	Sr Accounting Technician	Purchasing Assistant	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
<u>March 2008 (BOD - 03/14/08)</u>						
Classification Study	Payroll Specialist	Payroll Specialist	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
<u>December 2007 (BOD - 11/21/08)</u>						
Classification and Comp Study	Safety and Training Coordinator	Safety and Training Coordinator	\$25.12 - \$32.05	\$26.88 - \$34.30	6.56%	Position description and pay change

<b>Classification Study, Reclassification, or Comp Study (Salary Survey)</b>						
<b>June 2011 - December 2015</b>						
Type of Request	Original Position Title	New Position Title	Old pay	Recommended Pay	Step 6 % Change	Remarks
<b>July 2007 (BOD - 09/26/08)</b>						
Classification Study	Administrative Assistant/Supervisor	Administrative Assistant/Supervisor	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
<b>June 2007 (BOD - 06/22/07)</b>						
Classification Study	Lead Parts Clerk	Lead Parts Clerk	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
Classification Study	Parts Clerk	Parts Clerk	N/A	N/A	0.00%	Position description change only
<b>December 2006 (BOD - 04/27/07)</b>						
Classification and Comp Study	Payroll and Benefits Coordinator	Financial Analyst	\$20.37 - \$26.02	\$24.14 - \$30.81	15.55%	Position description and pay change
<b>December 2005 (BOD - 01/26/07)</b>						
Comp Study	Administrative Assistant/Supervisor	Administrative Assistant/Supervisor	\$17.19 - \$21.92	\$18.39 - \$23.47	6.60%	Pay change only
Comp Study	Administrative Assistant	Administrative Assistant	\$16.37 - \$20.89	\$17.52 - \$22.37	6.62%	Pay change only
Comp Study	Administrative Services Coordinator	Administrative Services Coordinator	\$21.87 - \$27.95	\$23.40 - \$29.86	6.40%	Pay change only
Comp Study	Transit Supervisor	Transit Supervisor	\$22.13 - \$28.21	\$23.24 - \$29.66	4.89%	Pay change only